# Extragalactic Planetary Nebulae 

Holland Ford and Eric Peng<br>Johns Hopkins University, Homewood Campus, Baltimore, MD 21013, USA

Ken Freeman<br>Research School of Astronomy ${ }^{\circ}$ Astrophysics, Australian National University, Canberra, ACT 2611


#### Abstract

Planetary nebulae (PNe) can be used to trace intermediate and old stellar populations in galaxies and the intracluster medium out to approximately 20 Mpc . PNe can be easily identified with narrow-band surveys, and their chemical abundances and radial velocities can be measured with multi-slit or multi-fiber spectrographs. We briefly review what has been accomplished to date, and include tables (with references) that summarize the observations of PNe in 42 galaxies and in the intracluster media of the Virgo and Fornax clusters. The surveys for intracluster PNe suggest that between $20 \%$ and $50 \%$ of the clusters' total stellar mass is in the intracluster medium! We illustrate the utility of PNe for dynamical studies by presenting results from a recently completed survey of Cen A (NGC 5128) with the NOAO mosaic camera on the CTIO 4-m telescope. The PNe and globular cluster surveys extend respectively to distances of 80 Kpc and 50 Kpc . We compare the kinematics of the stars in Cen A ( 736 PN velocities) to the kinematics of the red and blue globular clusters ( 188 clusters with measured velocities). The latter include 125 newly confirmed globular clusters from our survey.


## 1. Introduction

Planetary nebulae (PNe) can be used to trace old and intermediate-age stellar populations in galaxies and in the intracluster medium out to approximately 20 Mpc. Photometric and spectroscopic observations of PNe provide information about: 1) the stellar death rate, 2) the chemical composition of the planetaries' parent stars, 3) the distance to the galaxy, and 4) the stellar dynamics of the parent stellar population and the distribution of mass in the galaxy.

Planetary nebulae in the intracluster or intragroup medium (ICPNe) provide a measure of past tidal stripping and tidal disruption of galaxies within the cluster or group. Depending on the evolutionary state of the cluster, ICPNe may provide thousands of test particles that can be used to study the cluster's dynamics.

## 2. Identification of PNe and Camera/Telescopes Suitable for PNe Surveys

Planetary nebulae mark the endpoint of stellar evolution for stars with masses between $\sim 0.8$ and $8 \mathrm{M}_{\odot}$ (Iben \& Renzini, 1983; Dopita et al. 1997). The expanding shell (or shells) of a planetary nebula is ejected during the ascent of the asymptotic giant branch. The shell is ionized by the ultraviolet radiation from the newly exposed, hot helium-burning core. A large fraction of the radiation from the core, which has a luminosity equal to a red giant, is absorbed via ionization of hydrogen and helium, and converted into emission lines from the most abundant elements. The temperature of the nebula is set by equilibrium between heating from ionization and cooling from permitted and forbidden emission lines. Radiation from [OIII] $\lambda 4959 / 5007$ is one of the most efficient cooling lines; the monochromatic luminosity in [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ is comparable to the Vband luminosity of the K-giants in old stellar populations. Consequently, PNe can be efficiently identified by taking pairs of on-band and off-band [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ images. When using ground-based telescopes, PNe in galaxies beyond the Magellanic Clouds will be unresolved, absent in the off-band image, and brighter in [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ than $\mathrm{H} \alpha$. Detailed descriptions of PNe survey techniques and issues that must be considered when selecting and buying interference filters can be found in Ford et al. (1989) and Jacoby et al. (1992).

Telescope and camera combinations that are particularly suitable for PNe surveys are summarized in Table 1. Column five gives the product of the telescope's aperture times the field of view, $\mathrm{A} \times \Omega$, normalized to the Subaru telescope's "Suprime" camera. All else being equal (seeing and camera throughput), $\mathrm{A} \times \Omega$ is a figure of merit for a camera/telescope's survey capability. The last column gives the distance at which a PN one magnitude fainter than the brightest PN will have a signal-to-noise ratio of 10 in the sum of four 2250 second exposures. We assumed that the seeing is $0.75^{\prime \prime}$ FWHM, the net atmosphere/telescope/camera throughput is 0.5 , the readnoise is $6 \mathrm{e}^{-}$RMS per pixel, and the sky brightness and isophotal galaxy brightness are $V=22 \mathrm{mag} / \square^{\prime \prime}$. For the MMT we assumed that the sky and galaxy surface brightnesses are 21.8 , and that the CCDs are binned $3 \times 3$ before readout.

Table 1. Telescopes and Cameras That Are Suitable for PNe Surveys

| Telescope | Camera <br> Format | Pixel Size <br> $\left({ }^{\prime \prime}\right)$ | FOV <br> $($ arc-min $)$ | $\mathrm{A} \times \Omega$ | Dist <br> $(\mathrm{Mpc})$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| WHT 4.2-m/PNS | $2 \mathrm{k} \times 2 \mathrm{k}$ | $0.33 \times 0.30$ | $11.3 \times 10.3$ | 0.045 | 20 |
| ESO 2.2-m | $8 \mathrm{k} \times 8 \mathrm{k}$ | 0.24 | $34 \times 33$ | 0.12 | 14 |
| CTIO $4-\mathrm{m}$ | $8 \mathrm{k} \times 8 \mathrm{k}$ | 0.27 | $36 \times 36$ | 0.45 | 20 |
| MMT 6.5-m | $18 \mathrm{k} \times 18 \mathrm{k}$ | 0.08 | $24 \times 24$ | 0.66 | 25 |
| CFHT $3.6-\mathrm{m}$ | $20 \mathrm{k} \times 18 \mathrm{k}$ | 0.18 | $62 \times 56$ | 0.97 | 18 |
| Subaru $8.2-\mathrm{m}$ | $10 \mathrm{k} \times 18 \mathrm{k}$ | 0.20 | $30 \times 24$ | 1 | 29 |

The Planetary Nebula Spectrograph (PNS) (Arnaboldi et al. 2001; Douglas, 2001) on the William Herschel Telescope is a slitless spectrograph preceded by a narrow band [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ filter. The spectrograph is rotated $180^{\circ}$ between exposures. When the images are compared, PNe will be pairs of stellar sources
whose separations are proportional to their radial velocities, whereas stars will be dispersed into short spectra. The PNS will be very effective for measuring the radial velocities of PNe for two reasons. When the seeing is very good, as frequently is the case on the WHT (Wilson et al. 1999), the effective slit will be the seeing FWHM. And, a second observing run is not required to measure the radial velocities.

The Hubble Advanced Camera for Surveys will be able to detect ICPNe one magnitude fainter than the brightest PN at a distance of $\sim 200 \mathrm{Mpc}$ when the sky is as faint or fainter than $23.2 \mathrm{~V}-\mathrm{mag} / \square^{\prime \prime}$.

## 3. Abundance Determinations Using PNe

Spectroscopic observations of planetary nebulae are presently the only way to measure the chemical abundances of individual elements in old and intermediate age stars at distances of $\sim 1 \mathrm{Mpc}$ or greater. Although the nebular abundances of $\mathrm{He}, \mathrm{C}, \mathrm{N}$, and S are enhanced by nucleosynthesis in the parent star (e.g. Dopita et al. 1997), comparisons can be made of relative abundances from one part of a galaxy to another, and between galaxies.

In the LMC, $[\mathrm{O} / \mathrm{H}]$ in bright PNe has the same value as $[\mathrm{O} / \mathrm{H}]$ in HII regions (Richer 1993); consequently, the oxygen abundance measured in PNe is a good measure of the oxygen abundance in the gas from which the parent stars formed.

With the exception of the $\mathrm{He} / \mathrm{H}$ ratio, direct abundance determinations require the measurement of the electron temperature $T_{e}$, the electron density $n_{e}$, and line intensities in two or more ionization stages. Because the crucial temperature diagnostic line [OIII] $\lambda 4363$ is 50 to 200 times weaker than [OIII] $\lambda 5007$, the measurement of this faint line sets the distance limit for abundance determinations. To date, direct abundance measurements have not been made in galaxies more distant than M31. Indirect PNe abundance determinations based on diagnostic line ratios have been made in NGC 5128 (Walsh et al. 1999).

Jacoby \& Ciardullo (1999) measured the chemical abundances in 15 M31 PNe. Their paper, which finds a wide range in $[\mathrm{O} / \mathrm{H}]$ in M31's old stellar populations, is a model for these difficult observations.

## 4. The Planetary Nebula Luminosity Function

Image intensifier detections of PNe in M31 and its dwarf companions (NGC 147, NGC 185, NGC 205, and M32) with the Lick 3-m telescope (Ford, Jenner, \& Epps 1973; Ford \& Jenner 1975; Ford, Jacoby, \& Jenner 1977; Ford \& Jacoby 1978 ) and subsequent Image Tube Scanner spectrophotometry showed that the brightest nebulae had approximately the same [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ flux. We reasoned that if we compared similar old stellar populations, the main sequence turn-off masses would be similar. Consequently, there would be a maximum number of ionizing photons that could be produced by a planetary's central star, and a maximum [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ flux. Using this reasoning, we proposed that planetary nebulae might be used as standard candles (Ford \& Jenner, 1978). Although the utility of the planetary nebula luminosity function (PNLF) has been controversial (Sandage \& Tammann 1990; Bottinelli 1991;Tammann 1993), a great deal of observational work (e.g. Ciardullo et al. 1989a; Ciardullo et al. 1989b;

Jacoby et al. 1989) showed that the PNLF in the bulges of spiral galaxies and in early type galaxies is an excellent standard candle with little or no dependence on Hubble type. Analytical, theoretical, and numerical models (Jacoby, 1989; Dopita, Jacoby, \& Vassiliadis 1992; Mendez 1993) established the theoretical basis for the observational fact that the PNLF is a good standard candle. These studies showed that the PNLF has only a modest dependence on the ages and metallicities of the parent population, and the number of PNe observed. However, the observed dependencies appear to be much smaller than those predicted by the models. Jacoby, Walker, and Ciardullo (1990) found that the observed PNLF distance to the LMC is in excellent agreement with the LMC Cepheid distance.

Ciardullo et al. (1989a; C89a) developed the model for the PNLF that has been used so successfully for deriving distances to galaxies that do not have cepheids. Their representation of the PNLF is given in equation 1.

$$
\begin{equation*}
N(M) \propto e^{0.307 M}\left(1-e^{3\left(M^{*}-M\right)}\right) \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

$M^{*}$ in equation 1 cuts off the luminosity function and serves as a "standard candle". Based on a distance of 770 Kpc to M31, the calibration of the PNLF was given by $M^{*}=-4.48$ (C89a). Using Madore \& Freedman's (1991) Cepheid distance to M31, Ciardullo et al. (1998) derived $M^{*}=-4.54$. More recently Ferrarese et al. (2000) derived $M^{*}=-4.58$ by comparing PNLF distances with HST Cepheid distances to the same galaxies, or to galaxies in the same group or cluster. They found a very tight linear relationship between the PNLF and Cepheid distances. The PNLF distances to the Virgo and Fornax clusters appear to be systematically smaller than the Cepheid distances. This may be due to intracluster PNe; in a magnitude-limited sample, these will be preferentially on the nearside of the cluster (see Section 6).

The relationship between the apparent monochromatic magnitude $m_{5007}$ and the observed monochromatic flux $F_{5007}$ is given by

$$
\begin{equation*}
m_{5007}=-2.5 \log F_{5007}-13.74 . \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

The [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ flux from an $M^{*}$ planetary at 10 parsecs is $1.977 \times 10^{-4}$ $\operatorname{ergs} \mathrm{cm}^{-2} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$.

## 5. Summary of Surveys for Extragalactic PNe

At the time of writing, approximately 5000 PNe have been identified in more than 40 external galaxies. These observations are summarized in Table 2. The galaxy types were taken from the RSA (Sandage \& Tammann 1980, 1987) when available. Galaxy distances in bold type are based on the PNLF. Column 4 gives the number of PNe identified in each galaxy and column 5 gives the references for the identifications. The sixth column list references for those galaxies that have chemical abundance determinations for their PNe. Space did not permit inclusion of the large number of chemical abundance studies of PNe in the LMC and SMC. References for galaxies with PNe radial velocities and dynamical studies are listed in the last column of Table 2.

Table 2. Observations of Extragalactic Planetary Nebulae

| Galaxy | Type | Dist <br> (Mpc) | $\begin{aligned} & \text { No. } \\ & \text { of PNe } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { ID } \\ & \text { Refs } \end{aligned}$ | Chem <br> Abund <br> Refs | Radial Velocity References |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sag Df | ImIV-V | 0.025 | 2 | Z96 | W97 | Z96 |
| Fornax | Irr III-IV |  | 1 | D78 | D78,W97 | D78 |
| SMC | ImIV-V | 0.062 | 62 | M95 | * | F68 |
| LMC | Irr | 0.049 | 280 | L97 | * | F68, S72 |
| LMC |  |  |  |  |  | F79b,M88 |
| N 147 | dE5 |  | 5 | F77 |  | F77 |
| N 185 | dE3p | 0.57 | 5 | F73,F77 | R95 | F77 |
| N 205 | S0/E5p | 0.76 | 28 | F73,C89b | R95 |  |
| N 6822 | ImIV-V |  | 7 | K82 | K82,R95 |  |
| M31 | SbI-II | 0.77 | 1000 | F78, L82 | J86,S98, | L82, L83 |
| M31 |  |  |  | C89b | J99,R99 | N87, H94 |
| M31 |  |  |  |  | H00 | E00 |
| M32 | E2 | $<0.77$ | 30 | F73, F75 | J79,S98 | N86 |
| M32 |  |  |  | C89b | R99,H00 |  |
| M33 | Sc(s)II-III | 0.84 | 138 | M01, C01 |  |  |
| M33 |  | 0.85 | 58 | K99 |  |  |
| IC 10 | dIrr |  | 1 | J81 |  |  |
| Leo A | dIrr |  | 2 | J81 |  |  |
| Sex A | dIrr |  | 1 | J81 |  |  |
| Peg | dI/dSph |  | 1 | J81 |  |  |
| WLM | IrrIV-V |  | 2 | J81 |  |  |
| N 300 | ScII. 8 | 2.4 | 34 | S96 |  |  |
| M81 | Sb (r)I-II | 3.50 | 185 | J89 |  |  |
| N 2403 | $\mathrm{Sc}(\mathrm{s}) \mathrm{III}$ | 3.26 | 40 | K99 |  |  |
| N 5128 | S0+S pec | 3.5 | 1140 | H93b,P02 | W99 | H93a,H95 |
| N 5128 |  |  |  | F02 |  | M96, M99 |
| N 5128 |  |  |  |  |  | P02 |
| N 5102 | S0_1(5) | 3.1 | 26 | M94a |  |  |
| N 4736 | SA(r)ab | 6.0 | 67 | D00 |  | D00 |
| N 3627 | Sb(s)II. 2 | 10.41 | 73 | K99 |  |  |
| N 3377 | E6 | 10.3 | 54 | C89a |  |  |
| N 3379 | E0 | 9.8 | 93 | C89a |  | C93, S99 |
| N 3379 |  |  |  |  |  | S00 |
| N 3384 | SB0 | 10.1 | 102 | C89a |  | T95 |
| N 3368 | Sab(s)II | 9.6 | 74 | F96B |  |  |
| N 1023 | SB0_1(5) | 9.86 | 110 | C91 |  |  |
| N 891 | Sb | 9.86 | 33 | C91 |  |  |
| N 5194 | $\mathrm{Sbc}(\mathrm{s}) \mathrm{I}-\mathrm{II}$ | 8.4 | 64 | F96b |  |  |
| N 5457 | $\mathrm{Sc}(\mathrm{s}) \mathrm{I}$ | 7.7 | 65 | F96a,F96b |  |  |
| N 4594 | $\mathrm{Sa}+/ \mathrm{Sb}-$ | 8.9 | 294 | F96c |  |  |
| N 4374 | E1 | 15.7 | 102 | J90 |  |  |
| N 4382 | S0_1(3) pec | 14.4 | 102 | J90 |  |  |
| N 4406 | S0_1(3)/E3 | 15.7 | 141 | J90 |  | A96 |
| N 4472 | E1/S0_1(1) | 13.9 | 54 | J90 |  |  |


| Table 2. |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| (Continued) |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Galaxy | Type | Dist <br> $(\mathrm{Mpc})$ | No. <br> of Pne | ID <br> Refs | Chem <br> Abund <br> Refs | RV <br> Refs |
| N 4486 | E0 | $\mathbf{1 3 . 3}$ | 338 | J90, C98 |  |  |
| N 4649 | S0_1(2) | $\mathbf{1 4 . 2}$ | 32 | J90 |  |  |
| N 4478 | E2 | 13.3 | 7 | C98 |  |  |
| IC3443 | dE0 |  | 1 | C98 |  | A98 |
| N 1316 | Sa pec | $\mathbf{1 6 . 8}$ | 105 | M94b |  | S00 |
| N 1399 | E1 | $\mathbf{1 7 . 1}$ | 72 | M94b |  |  |
| N 1404 | E2 | $\mathbf{1 7 . 0}$ | 47 | M94b |  |  |

## 6. Intracluster Planetary Nebulae

The discovery of intracluster planetary nebulae (ICPNe) in the Virgo and Fornax clusters is one of the most interesting new developments in the study of extragalactic PNe. ICPNe were first discovered by Arnaboldi et al. (1996; A96) in a survey of the Virgo galaxy NGC 4406. Spectra were taken of PNe candidates (Jacoby et al. 1990; J90) in two fields that were centered $134^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{E}$ and $134^{\prime \prime} \mathrm{W}$ of NGC 4406. Sixteen of the PNe candidates in the two fields have radial velocities near N4406's systemic velocity of $-227 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$. Three of the candidates in the W field have velocities of $1729 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}, 1651 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$, and $1340 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$, provided the observed emission line is [OIII] $\lambda 5007$. At these redshifts, the [OIII] $\lambda 4959$ emission line falls in J90's on-band filter ( $\lambda_{c} \sim 4998 \AA$, FWHM $\sim 30 \AA$ ), accounting for the detection of the high velocity PNe. Because the nebulae were identified with a filter centered at $4998 \AA$, the emission lines detected spectroscopically at $\sim 5033 \AA$ cannot be Ly $\alpha$ from galaxies with redshifts $z \sim 3.14$. A96 suggested that these three nebulae are PNe from a Virgo intracluster stellar population.

Subsequent surveys of the Virgo and Fornax clusters have identified 300 emission line sources that may be ICPNe. The surveys are summarized in Table 3. Column 5 lists the survey authors' estimated fraction of the cluster's total stellar mass that is in the intracluster medium. These estimates suggest that $20 \%$ to $50 \%$ of a cluster's stellar mass may be in the intracluster medium!

Depending on the depth of the survey, $25 \%$ or more of the PNe candidates may be starbursting galaxies at $z \sim 3.1$ with Ly $\alpha$ emission redshifted into the [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ on-band filter (cf Kudritzki et al. 2000; Krelove et al. 1999; Freeman et al. 2000). Provided there is a sufficient signal-to-noise ratio in the spectra, PNe can be distinguished from starbursting galaxies and QSOs at $z \sim 3.1$ by the presence of [OIII] $\lambda 4959$ and the absence of a continuum. At spectral resolutions of $\sim 10 \AA$ or higher, the Ly $\alpha$ emission line will be resolved, whereas [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ in a PN with an expansion velocity of $\sim 20 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$ will be unresolved.

Several arguments suggest that a large fraction of the ICPNe candidates are in fact intracluster planetary nebulae. Freeman et al. (2001) spectroscopically confirmed 23 ICPNe in the Virgo cluster by detecting [OIII] $\lambda 4959$ and [OIII] $\lambda 5007$ at the expected wavelengths and intensity ratio. The anomalous

Table 3. ICPNe Candidates in the Virgo and Fornax Clusters

| Cluster | Fields | Survey Area <br> (sq-arcmin) | Num. of ICPNe <br> Candidates | IC-Stellar <br> Fraction | Refs |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Virgo | N 4406 | 32 | 3 | - | A96 |
| Virgo | Virgo Core | 50 | 11 | 0.5 | M87 |
| Virgo | 2 Intracluster | 512 | 85 | 0.2 | F98 |
| Virgo | M87 Halo | 256 | $\sim 75$ | - | C98 |
| Virgo | Intracluster | - | 23 confirmed | - | F00 |
| Fornax | Intra-cluster | 104 | 10 | 0.4 | T97 |
| Fornax | Intra-cluster | $0.58 \mathrm{sq-deg}$ | $\sim 135$ | $0.15-0.2$ | K00 |

PNLF in M87's halo has PNe that are brighter than the PNe in M87's main body, and thus are likely foreground ICPNe (Ciardullo et al. 1998). SN 1980I occurred midway between NGC 4374 and NGC 4406, showing that there are intracluster stars in the Virgo cluster (Smith, 1981). Ferguson, Tanvir, \& von Hippel (1998) used HST images to detect faint intracluster stars in isolated Virgo fields. This population of (old) stars will produce planetary nebulae.

ICPNe are important for many reasons. They may provide thousands of test particles for detailed studies of the mass distribution in clusters. Their kinematics may reveal otherwise unobservable tidal streams that record tidal interactions over the last few Giga-years.

Little is known about the presence of intragroup stars in small groups of galaxies. If groups of galaxies have the same fraction of luminous intergalactic material as estimated for Virgo and Fornax, there could be hundreds of intergalactic PNe. The kinematics of these nebulae could be used to investigate the distribution of mass in sparse groups, and to study the history of tidal interactions.

## 7. Stellar Populations in Cen A's Halo

PNe and globular clusters (GCs) are both used as probes of galaxy halos. While PNe sample the field star population, and have emission lines that are more conducive to identification and radial velocity measurements, GCs are old star clusters for which we also can obtain metallicity and size information. Together, PNe and GCs are complementary tools for studying the structure and evolutionary histories of early-type galaxies.

At a distance of 3.5 Mpc (Hui et al. 1993; H93b), Centaurus A (NGC 5128) is the nearest massive elliptical galaxy, making it an excellent target for PNe and GC studies. Previous PNe surveys (H93b, Hui et al. 1995; H95) identified 785 PNe out to 20 Kpc along the major axis and 10 Kpc along the minor axis, and resulted in velocities for 433 PNe . We recently completed an extended survey that reaches projected radii of 80 and 40 Kpc along the major and minor axes, respectively. This brings the total number of PNe to 1140 , of which 736 have velocities. In addition, we conducted a UBVRI survey with spectroscopic follow-up out to 50 and 30 Kpc to find new GCs and study the faint halo light.


Figure 1. Cen $A P N$ and $G C$ Smoothed Velocity Fields. The $\mathrm{x} / \mathrm{y}$-axes are the photometric major/minor axes. The dotted ellipses are 1-4 $r_{e}$ isophotes for the old stellar light. Each point is a confirmed PN or GC. The mean velocity field at each object is the radial velocity average of all objects within $r \leq 3 \mathrm{Kpc}$. In sparse regions, the velocities are averaged with nearby neighbors. Velocities greater/less than systemic are represented by an " x "/box, with a point size proportional to the absolute deviation from systemic (up to $\sim \pm 150 \mathrm{~km} / \mathrm{s}$ ). We assume point symmetry (valid in a triaxial potential), and reflect each object through the origin while reversing the sign of its velocity wrt the galaxy. a) (top) The PN velocity field. Overplotted are the outlines of our survey (large boxes), and the zero velocity contour. Points appear to exist outside our survey area because of the assumed point symmetry, creating a 1472 particle field. The zero-velocity contour has a strong twist in the inner regions. b) (bottom left) The Red GC Velocity Field. There are 86 GCs redder than $(V-I)_{0}=0.98$, the dip in the bimodal color distribution. These GCs are more centrally concentrated than the blue GCs, and rotate in a sense similar to the PNe. c) (bottom right) The Velocity Field for 99 Blue GCs. These are more extended than the red GCs, and have kinematics less similar to the PNe.

In total, there are now 188 GCs with measured velocities in Cen A, 125 of which are newly discovered from our survey.

The smoothed PN velocity field shown in Figure 1 is the most detailed and extensive stellar velocity field in an elliptical galaxy to date. The rotation in the halo, discovered at 20 Kpc in previous work (H95), is now evident to the 80 Kpc limit of our survey. Most striking, however, is the previously undetected twist in the zero-velocity contour. Earlier work detected kinematic misalignments in Cen A and in other ellipticals (H95; Franx, Illingworth, \& Heckman 1989), but this is some of the first compelling evidence for a twist in the kinematic axis. Misalignment and twisting of the kinematic axis are predicted for triaxial galaxies seen in projection (Statler 1991), and also are seen in merger simulations (e.g. Bendo \& Barnes 2000). This program is an excellent advertisement for the potential of future PNe surveys.

Globular cluster candidates were identified from UBVRI CCD imaging based on morphological and color criteria. Radial velocities confirm membership in the Cen A GC system ( $V_{\text {systemic }}=541 \mathrm{~km} \mathrm{~s}^{-1}$ ), and provide kinematic information. We constructed the velocity fields for the GCs using our observations of new and known GCs, combined with 29 velocities from Harris et al. (1992). The $V-I$ color distribution of GCs is confirmed to be bimodal. Using the $V-I$ color, a proxy for metallicity in old stellar systems, we can separate the GCs into blue (metal-poor) and red (metal-rich) populations. Figure 1 shows the spatial distribution and velocity fields of the two GC populations. The red GCs are more centrally concentrated, and more rotationally supported than the blue GCs. The kinematics of the PNe are more like those of the red GCs than the blue. This is consistent with the field stars in Cen A being predominantly metal-rich (Harris \& Harris 2001), and with the red clusters and PNe having a common formation history.

Acknowledgments. This research has made use of NASA's Astrophysics Data System Abstract Service and the NASA/IPAC Extragalactic Database (NED) which is operated by the Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, under contract with the National Aeronautics and Space Administration. The authors wish to thank the CTIO staff for their excellent help during the observing runs on the CTIO 4 -m telescope. This research was supported in part by NASA grant NAG5-7697 and NSF grant AST-0098566.

## References

Arnaboldi, M., Capaccioli, M., Douglas, N., Kuijken, K., Freeman, K., Alexrod, T., Taylor, K., Gilmozzi, R., \& Kudritzki, R. 2001, preprint

Arnaboldi, M., Freeman, K.C., Gerhard, O., Matthias, M., Kudritzki, R.P., Mendez, R.H., Capaccioli, M., \& Ford, H.C. 1998, ApJ, 507, 759 (A98)
Arnaboldi, M., Freeman, K.C., Mendez, R.H., Capaccioli, M., Ciardullo, R., Ford, H., Gerhard, O., Hui, X., Jacoby, G.H., Kudritzki, R.P., and Quinn, P.J. 1996, 472, 145 (A96)

Bendo, G. \& Barnes, J. 2000, MNRAS, 316, 315
Bottinelli, L., Gouguenheim, L., Paturel, G., Teerikorpi, P. 1991, A\&A, 252, 550
Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G. H., \& Dejonghe, H.B. 1993, ApJ, 414, 454 (C93)

Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G. H., Feldmeier, J.J. \& Bartlett, R. 1998, ApJ, 492, 62 (C98)
Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G H., \& Ford, H.C. 1989a, ApJ, 344, 715 (C89a)
Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G., Ford, H.C., \& Neill, J.D. 1989, ApJ, 339, 53 (C89b)
Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G.H., \& Harris, W.E. 1991, 383, 487 (C91)
Corral, L. J. \& Herrero, A. 2001, A\&A, 376, 820 (C01)
Danziger, I. J., Webster, B. L., Dopita, M. A., \& Hawarden, T. G. 1978, ApJ, 220, 458 (D78)
Dopita , M. A., Vassiliadis , E., Wood , P. R., Meatheringham , S. J., Harrington , J. P., Bohlin , R. C., Ford , H. C., Stecher , T. P., \& S. P. Maran 6 1997, ApJ, 474, 188 (D97)
Dopita, M. A., Jacoby, G. H., \& Vassiliadis, E. 1992, ApJ, 389, 27
Douglas, N. 2001, www.astro.rug.nl/~ndouglas
Douglas, N. G., Gerssen, J., Kuijken, K., \& Merrifield, M. R.2000, MNRAS, 316, 795 (D00)
Eather, R. H. \& Reasoner, D. L. 1969, Appl. Optics, 8, 227
Evans, N. W. \& Wilkinson, M. I. 2000, MNRAS, 316, 929 (E00)
Feast, M. W. 1968, MNRAS, 140, 345 (F68)
Feitzinger, J. V. \& Weiss, G. 1979, A\&AS, 37, 575 (F79b)
Feldmeir, J. J., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1996, ApJ, 479, 231 (F96b)
Feldmeir, J. J., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1996, ApJL, 461, L25 (F96a)
Feldmeir, J. J., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1998, ApJ, 503, 109 (F98)
Ferguson, H. C., Tanvir, N. R., \& von Hippel, T. 1998, Nature, 391, 461
Ferrarese, L., Mould, J. R., Kennicutt, R.C. Jr ., Huchra, J., Ford , H. C., Freedman, W. L., Stetson , P. B., Madore , B. F., Sakai, S., Gibson, B. K., Graham ,J. A., Hughes, S. M., Illingworth , G. D., Kelson ,D. D., Macri , L., Sebo , K., \& Silbermann, N. A. 2000, ApJ, 529, 745
Ford, H. C., Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G.H., and Hui, X. 1989, IAUS, 131, 335
Ford, H. C, Hui, X., Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G. H., \& Freeman, K. C. 1996, ApJ, 458, 455 (F96c)
Ford, H. C. \& Jacoby, G. H. 1978, ApJ, 219, 437
Ford, H. C. \& Jacoby, G. H. 1978, ApJS, 38, 351 (F78)
Ford, H. C., Jacoby, G., \& Jenner, D. C.1977, ApJ, 213,18 (F77)
Ford, H. C. \& Jenner, D. C. 1975, ApJ, 202, 365 (F75)
Ford, H. C. \& Jenner, D. C. 1978, BAAS, 10, 665
Ford, H. C., Jenner, D. C., \& Epps, H. W. 1973, ApJ, 183, L73 (F73)
Ford, H. C., Peng, E., \& Freeman, K. C. 2002, This paper (F02)
Franx, M., Illingworth, G., \& Heckman, T. 1989, ApJ, 344, 613
Freeman, K. C., Arnaboldi, M., Capaccioli, M., Ciardullo, R., Feldmeier, J., Ford, H., Gerhard, O., Kudritzki, R., Jacoby, G., Mndez, R. H., Sharples, R. 2000, in "Dynamics of Galaxies: from the Early Universe to the Present", ed. F. Combes, G. A. Mamon, \& V. Charmandaris, ASP Conference Series, 197, 389 (F00)

Harris, G. \& Harris, W. 2001, AJ, 120, 2423
Harris, G., Harris, Geisler, D., Harris, H., \& Hesser, J. 1992, AJ, 104, 613
Hui, X. 1993, PASP, 105, 1011 (H93a)
Hui, X., Ford, H. C., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H.1993, ApJS, 88, 423 (H93b)
Hui, X., Ford, H. C., Freeman, K. C., \& Dopita, M. A. 1995, ApJ, 449, 592 (H95)
Hui, X., Ford, H., \& Jacoby, G. 1994, BAAS, 184, 48.06 (H94)
Hyung, S., Aller, L. H., Han, S., Kim, Y., Han, W., \& Choi, Y. 2000, JKAS, 33, 97 (H00)
Iben, I., Jr.\& Renzini, A. 1983, ARA\&A, 21, 271
Jacoby, G. H. 1989, ApJ, 339, 39
Jacoby, G. H., Branch, D., Ciardullo, R., Davies, R. L., Harris, W. E., Pierce, M. J., Pritchet, C. J., Tonry, J. L., \& Welch, D. L. 1992, PASP, 104, 599

Jacoby, G. H. \& Ciardullo, R. 1999, ApJ, 515, 169 (J99)
Jacoby, George H., Ciardullo, R., Booth, J., \& Ford, H. C. 1989, ApJ, 344, 704 (J89)
Jacoby, G. H., Ciardullo, R., \& Ford, H. C. 1990, ApJ, 356, 332 (J90)
Jacoby, G. H. \& DeMarco, O. 1999, BAAS, 195, 110.06 (J96)
Jacoby, G. H. \& Ford, H. 1986, ApJ, 304, 490 (J86)
Jacoby, G. H. \& Lesser, M. P. 1981, AJ, 86, 185 (J81)
Jacoby, G. H, Walker, A. R. \& Ciardullo, R. 1990, ApJ, 365, 471
Jenner, D. C., Ford, H. C., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1979, ApJ, 227, 391(J79)
Killen, R. M. \& Dufour, R. 1982, PASP, 94, 444 (K82)
Krelove, K., Ciardullo, R., Feldmeier, J. J., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1999, BAAS, 195, 80.05

Krelove, K., Feldmeier, J., Ciardullo, R., \& Durrell, P. R. 2000, BAAS, 197, 106.07 (K00)

Kudritzki, R.-P., Mndez, R. H., Feldmeier, J. J., Ciardullo, R., Jacoby, G. H., Freeman, K. C., Arnaboldi, M., Capaccioli, M., Gerhard, O., \& Ford, H. C. 2000, ApJ, 536, 19

Kuzio, R. E., Ciardullo, R., Feldmeier, J. J., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1999, BAAS, 195, 11.03 (K99)

Lawrie, D. G. \& Ford, H. C. 1982, ApJ, 256, 120 (L82)
Lawrie, D. G. 1983, ApJ, 273, 562 (L83)
Leisy, P., Dennefeld, M., Alard, C., \& Guibert, J. 1997, A\&AS, 121, 407 (L97)
M.G. Richer , G. Stasinska, \& M.L. McCall 1999, A\&A Suppl Series, 135, 203 (R99)
Magrini, L., A. Cardwell, R. L. M., Corradi, A., Mampaso, \& M. Perinotto 2001, A\&A, 367, 498 (M01)
Mathieu, A. \& Dejonghe, H. 1999, MNRAS, 303, 455 (M99)
Mathieu, A., Dejonghe, H., \& Hui, X. 1996, A\&A, 309, 30 (M96)
McMillan, R., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1994, AJ, 108, 1610 (M94a)
McMillan, R., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1994, ApJ, 416, 62 (M94b)

Meatheringham, S. J., Dopita, M. A., Ford, H. C. \& Webster, B. L. 1988, ApJ, 327, 651 (M88)
Mendez, R. H., Kudritzki, R. P., Ciardullo, R., \& Jacoby, G. H. 1993, A\&A, 275, 534
Mendez, R. H., Guerrero, M. A., Freeman, K. C., Arnaboldi, M., Kudritzki, R. P., Hopp, U., Capaccioli, M., \& Ford, H. C. 1997, ApJ, 491, L23 (M97)

Morgan, D. H 1995, A\&AS, 112, 445 (M95)
Nolthenius, R. \& Ford, H. 1986, ApJ, 305, 600
Nolthenius, R. \& Ford, H. 1986, ApJ, 305, 600 (N86)
Nolthenius, R. \& Ford, H. 1987, ApJ, 317, 62 (N87)
Peng, E., Ford, H. C., \& Freeman, K. 2002 in preparation (P02)
Richer, M. G. 1993, ApJ, 415, 240
Richer, M. G. \& McCall, M. 1995, ApJ, 445, 642 (R95)
Saglia, R. P., Kronawitter, A., Gerhard, O., \& Bender, R. 2000, AJ, 119, 153 (S00)
Sandage, A. \& Tammann, G. A. 1990, ApJ, 365, 1
Sandage, A. \& Tammann, G. A. 1981, 1987, A Revised Shapley-Ames Catalog of Bright Galaxies (Publ. 635; Washington, DC: Carnegie Inst. Washington)
Sluis, A. P. \& Williams, T. B. 2000, BAAS, 197, 37.14 (S00)
Smith, H. A. 1981, AJ, 86, 998
Smith, M. G.\& Weedman, D. W. 1972, ApJ, 177, 595 (S72)
Soffner, T., Mendez, R.H., Jacoby, G.H., Ciardullo, R., Roth, M.M., \& Kudritzki, R.P. 1996, A\&A 306, 9 (S96)
Stasinska, G., Richer, M. G., \& Mc Call, M. L. 1998, A\&A, 336, 667 (S98)
Statler, T. 1991, AJ, 102, 882
Statler, T. S. \& Smecker-Hane, T. 1999, AJ, 117, 839 (S99)
Tammann, G. A. 1993, IAUS, 155, 515
Theuns, T. \& Warren, S. J. 1997, MNRAS, 284, L11 (T97)
Tremblay, B., Merritt, D., \& Williams, T. B. 1995, ApJ, Lett, 443, L5 (T95)
Walsh, J.R., Dudziak, G., Minnitie, D. \& Zijlstra, A.A. 1997, ApJ, 487, 651 (W97)
Walsh, J. R., Walton, N. A., Jacoby, G. H., \& Peletier, R. F. 1999, A\&A, 346, 753 (W99)
Wilson, R. W., O’Mahony, N. O., Packham, C., \& Azzaro, M. 1999, MNRAS, 309, 379
Zijlstra, A. A. \& Walsh, J. R. 1996, A\&A, 312, L21 (Z96)

